

# Table of Contents

---

<b>About the Authors</b> .....	vii
<b>Table of Chapters</b> .....	ix
<b>Preface</b> .....	xix

## **PART ONE: The Nature of Substantial Similarity**

### **Chapter 1 The Meaning and Significance of Substantial Similarity**

§ 1:1	Substantial Similarity As an Element of Copyright Infringement .....	1-1
§ 1:2	Probative Similarity Distinguished .....	1-5
§ 1:3	Striking Similarity Distinguished .....	1-9

### **Chapter 2 Principles of Substantial Similarity**

§ 2:1	<i>De Minimis</i> Threshold .....	2-2
§ 2:2	Similarities Must Be Found in Protected Material .....	2-5
§ 2:3	Unprotected Material .....	2-6
§ 2:3.1	Ideas .....	2-6
§ 2:3.2	Facts .....	2-12
§ 2:3.3	<i>Scènes à Faire</i> .....	2-14
§ 2:3.4	Clichés, Slogans, and Other Short Passages .....	2-16
§ 2:3.5	Uncopyrighted Copyrightable Materials .....	2-20
§ 2:3.6	Titles .....	2-20
§ 2:3.7	Quotations and Other Copied Material .....	2-21
§ 2:3.8	Elements Found in Nature .....	2-22
§ 2:4	Quantitative–Qualitative Standard .....	2-23
§ 2:5	Two Kinds of Similarities .....	2-26
§ 2:5.1	Verbatim Similarities and Paraphrases .....	2-27
§ 2:5.2	Total Concept and Feel .....	2-33
§ 2:6	Dissimilarities .....	2-38
§ 2:7	Intermediate Copying .....	2-41

**Chapter 3     Tests for Substantial Similarity**

§ 3:1	Ordinary Observer and More Discerning Ordinary Observer.....	3-5
§ 3:1.1	Second Circuit .....	3-5
[A]	Ordinary Observer Test.....	3-6
[B]	More Discerning Ordinary Observer Test.....	3-7
[C]	The Sliding Scale of Access and Probative Similarity .....	3-9
[D]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-10
§ 3:1.2	First Circuit.....	3-12
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-15
§ 3:1.3	Third Circuit .....	3-16
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-19
[B]	Special Test for Complex Subjects Including Computer Programs .....	3-20
§ 3:1.4	Fifth Circuit.....	3-20
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-22
§ 3:1.5	Seventh Circuit .....	3-23
[A]	The Role of Access and the Inverse Ratio Rule .....	3-26
[B]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-26
§ 3:2	Extrinsic/Intrinsic Test .....	3-27
§ 3:2.1	Ninth Circuit.....	3-27
[A]	Origin of the Extrinsic/Intrinsic Test .....	3-27
[B]	Evolution of the Extrinsic/Intrinsic Test.....	3-29
[C]	Analytic Dissection As Part of the Extrinsic Test .....	3-30
[D]	Intermediate Steps Between <i>Krofft</i> and <i>Shaw</i> .....	3-31
[E]	The Role of Access and the Inverse Ratio Rule .....	3-32
[F]	Summary Judgment Under the Extrinsic/ Intrinsic Test .....	3-34

*Table of Contents*

[G]	Preliminary Injunctions Under the Ninth Circuit Test .....	3-40
[H]	Difficulties in Applying the Extrinsic/ Intrinsic Test .....	3-40
[I]	Motion to Dismiss.....	3-41
§ 3:2.2	Fourth Circuit.....	3-42
[A]	Intended Audience Test .....	3-43
[B]	Intended Audience in Computer Cases .....	3-45
[C]	Intended Audience for Works Marketed to Children .....	3-46
[D]	Intended Audience Versus Ordinary Observer.....	3-49
[E]	Advantages and Disadvantages of the Intended Audience Test .....	3-49
[F]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-50
§ 3:2.3	Eighth Circuit .....	3-51
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-52
§ 3:3	Abstraction/Filtration/Comparison .....	3-53
§ 3:3.1	Tenth Circuit.....	3-53
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-57
§ 3:3.2	Sixth Circuit .....	3-57
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-61
§ 3:3.3	D.C. Circuit .....	3-63
[A]	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-64
§ 3:4	Eleventh Circuit .....	3-65
§ 3:4.1	Summary Judgment, Motion to Dismiss, and Preliminary Injunction .....	3-68
§ 3:5	Federal Circuit .....	3-69
§ 3:6	Preliminary Injunction Standards.....	3-69

## **PART TWO: Substantial Similarity and Specific Subject Matter**

### **Chapter 4      Fictional Literary and Dramatic Works**

§ 4:1	Unprotectable Elements .....	4-3
§ 4:2	Plot and Sequence of Events .....	4-4
§ 4:3	Dialogue .....	4-8
§ 4:4	Characters .....	4-10
§ 4:5	Theme .....	4-11
§ 4:6	Mood .....	4-12
§ 4:7	Setting .....	4-13
§ 4:8	Pace .....	4-13
§ 4:9	Total Concept and Feel .....	4-14

### **Chapter 5      Characters**

§ 5:1	Character Copyrightability .....	5-1
§ 5:2	Visual Depictions Versus Descriptions .....	5-4
§ 5:3	Proper Test for Infringement .....	5-6
§ 5:4	Abstract Similarities Are Not Sufficient .....	5-8
§ 5:5	Dissection Is Improper .....	5-9
§ 5:6	Trivial Similarities Are Not Substantial Similarities .....	5-11
§ 5:7	Characters May Be Split or Combined .....	5-11

### **Chapter 6      Nonfiction**

§ 6:1	Factual Works Generally .....	6-1
§ 6:2	Textbooks, Tests, and Other Educational Materials .....	6-5
§ 6:2.1	Textbooks .....	6-5
§ 6:2.2	Tests .....	6-5
§ 6:3	Docudramas and Other Fact-Based Works .....	6-7
§ 6:4	Television Game Shows and Other Unscripted Programs .....	6-8
§ 6:5	Reality Television .....	6-11

Table of Contents

**Chapter 7     Audiovisual Works**

§ 7:1     General Principles ..... 7-1  
§ 7:2     Similarities Among Story Elements ..... 7-3  
§ 7:3     Similarities Among Audiovisual Elements ..... 7-5  
§ 7:4     Similarities Among Both Story and Audiovisual  
          Elements ..... 7-8

**Chapter 8     Computer Programs**

§ 8:1     Computer Programs: Literary and  
          Audiovisual Works ..... 8-1  
§ 8:2     Infringement of the Literary Work ..... 8-2  
§ 8:3     Infringement of the Audiovisual Work ..... 8-3  
§ 8:4     Infringement of the Compilation ..... 8-4  
§ 8:5     Output Data ..... 8-6  
§ 8:6     Test for Infringement: Abstraction/Filtration/  
          Comparison ..... 8-8  
    § 8:6.1     Abstraction ..... 8-10  
    § 8:6.2     Filtration ..... 8-12  
        [A]     Distinguishing Between the Process and  
                the Expression of the Process ..... 8-14  
        [B]     Commands and Sequences: Process or  
                Expression? ..... 8-15  
        [C]     Idea-Expression Merger ..... 8-16  
        [D]     Elements Dictated by Efficiency ..... 8-17  
        [E]     Elements Dictated by Extrinsic Concerns ..... 8-18  
        [F]     Public Domain and *Scènes à Faire* ..... 8-20  
    § 8:6.3     Comparison ..... 8-22  
§ 8:7     Third Circuit's *Whelan* Test ..... 8-23  
§ 8:8     Ordinary Observer Test and Computer  
          Expert's Role ..... 8-24  
§ 8:9     Intended Audience Test ..... 8-26  
§ 8:10    Applying Abstraction/Filtration/Comparison to  
          Other Types of Works ..... 8-27  
§ 8:11    Computer Games ..... 8-27

**Chapter 9 Musical Works and Sound Recordings**

- § 9:1 Musical Works..... 9-2
  - § 9:1.1 Lyrics ..... 9-3
  - § 9:1.2 Music..... 9-7
- § 9:2 Sound Recordings..... 9-16
- § 9:3 Sampling ..... 9-17
  - § 9:3.1 Is There a Need for Substantial Similarity  
in Sampling Cases? A Split Between the  
Ninth and Sixth Circuits ..... 9-19
    - [A] Sixth Circuit: *Bridgeport Music v.  
Dimension Films* ..... 9-20
      - [A][1] The Facts in *Bridgeport*..... 9-20
      - [A][2] The District Court Opinion ..... 9-21
      - [A][3] The Sixth Circuit Opinion..... 9-22
        - [A][3][a] The Reason Substantial Similarity Is  
Not a Requirement ..... 9-22
        - [A][3][b] The Reason the *De Minimis* Principle  
Does Not Apply..... 9-23
        - [A][3][c] Other Factors Contributing to the  
Panel’s Decision ..... 9-24
      - [B] Ninth Circuit: *VMG Salsoul v. Ciccone* ..... 9-26
      - [C] Other Cases Concerning the Treatment  
of Sampling ..... 9-26
        - [C][1] Case Law Prior to *Bridgeport*..... 9-26
        - [C][2] Other Sampling Cases Involving Substantial  
Similarity and *De Minimis* Principles..... 9-28
      - [D] Statutory Construction ..... 9-29
        - [D][1] Significant History..... 9-29
        - [D][2] The Relevant Provisions of the  
Copyright Act ..... 9-31
          - [D][2][a] Section 101 (17 U.S.C. § 101) ..... 9-31
          - [D][2][b] Section 102 (17 U.S.C. § 102) ..... 9-32
          - [D][2][c] Section 106 (17 U.S.C. § 106) ..... 9-35
          - [D][2][d] Section 114 (17 U.S.C. § 114) ..... 9-36
        - [D][3] Policy and Other Concerns..... 9-38
          - [D][3][a] Perceived Benefit to the Music Industry ..... 9-38
          - [D][3][b] Effect on Creativity..... 9-39
          - [D][3][c] Perceived Benefit to Musicians ..... 9-39
          - [D][3][d] Sampler Culpability ..... 9-40
          - [D][4] Fair Use Implications..... 9-40

## Table of Contents

### **Chapter 10 Works of Visual Art**

§ 10:1	Photographs .....	10-1
§ 10:2	Illustrations and Paintings .....	10-17
§ 10:3	Sculpture .....	10-22
§ 10:4	Jewelry.....	10-24
§ 10:5	Fabric, Carpet, and Wallcovering Designs .....	10-27
§ 10:5.1	Overall Appearance .....	10-28
§ 10:5.2	Individual Shapes and Items .....	10-30
§ 10:5.3	Layout .....	10-31
§ 10:5.4	Color.....	10-32
§ 10:5.5	Selection, Coordination, and Arrangement.....	10-33
§ 10:5.6	Proper Scrutiny.....	10-36
§ 10:6	Dolls .....	10-37
§ 10:7	Stuffed Animals .....	10-42
§ 10:8	Maps.....	10-46

### **Chapter 11 Architectural Works**

§ 11:1	Generally.....	11-1
§ 11:2	Treatment of Specific Elements .....	11-9
§ 11:3	Limits on Protection of Architectural Works .....	11-12

### **Chapter 12 Choreography .....** 12-1

### **Chapter 13 Compilations and Collective Works**

§ 13:1	Definitions and Parameters of Protection .....	13-1
§ 13:2	“Narrowed” Substantial Similarity .....	13-3
§ 13:3	Selection.....	13-5
§ 13:4	Arrangement .....	13-9
§ 13:5	Computer Databases .....	13-11
§ 13:6	Short-Cut Proof .....	13-12
§ 13:7	Common Defenses .....	13-13
§ 13:8	Various Types of Compilations .....	13-13

### **Chapter 14 Works in Different Media and Different Formats.....** 14-1

**Chapter 15 Derivative Works**

§ 15:1 Definition of Derivative Work ..... 15-2  
§ 15:2 Comparison of Accused Work to Derivative Work ..... 15-6  
§ 15:3 Comparison of Accused Derivative Work to a  
Preexisting Work..... 15-7

**Chapter 16 Useful Articles**

§ 16:1 The *Star Athletica* Test..... 16-2  
§ 16:2 Pre-*Star Athletica* ..... 16-7  
§ 16:3 Post-*Star Athletica* ..... 16-18

**PART THREE: Trial and Appeal**

**Chapter 17 Selected Trial Issues**

§ 17:1 Expert Opinion ..... 17-1  
§ 17:2 Lay Opinion and Public Reaction ..... 17-9  
§ 17:3 Surveys ..... 17-11  
§ 17:4 Issue Preclusion ..... 17-12  
§ 17:5 Evidence of the Copyrighted Work ..... 17-15

**Chapter 18 Appellate Review ..... 18-1**

**Appendix A Works Compared ..... App. A-1**

**Appendix B Jury Instructions ..... App. B-1**

**Table of Cases ..... T-1**

**Defendant-Plaintiff Table ..... DP-1**

**Index ..... I-1**